Characterization of the Train-of-Four Response in Fast and Slow Muscles: Effect of d-Tubocurarine, Pancuronium, and Vecuronium

Nancy S. Day, M.D.,* George J. Blake, B.S.,† Frank G. Standaert, M.D.,‡ Kenneth L. Dretchen, Ph.D.§

The in vivo cat soleus and gastrocnemius muscles were used to compare isometric contraction strength and the train-of-four (T4) response (2 Hz for 2 s) of two muscle types (fast and slow) during onset of competitive neuromuscular blockade in order to determine the extent of the correlation between twitch depression and T4 fade. Prior to drug administration the muscles that were studied differed significantly in that the T4 ratio was 1.0 in the gastrocnemius and only 0.87 in the soleus. Three competitive neuromuscular-blocking agents were compared: d-tubocurarine, pancuronium, and vecuronium. d-Tubocurarine was found to produce a close correlation between the degrees of twitch strength depression and T4 for both muscles. However, these muscles demonstrated significantly different ED90 values (105 µg/kg for gastrocnemius, 150 µg/kg for soleus). Pancuronium also produced a similar relationship between twitch strength depression and T4 decrement for each muscle. In this case, however, there was little difference in their ED90 values for twitch depression (11.5 µg/kg for gastrocnemius, 15 µg/kg for soleus). The effects of vecuronium were quite different from the other two muscle relaxants. Although vecuronium produced a comparable correlation between twitch tension and T4 fade in fast muscle, no such relationship was found to exist in slow muscle. Even when the twitch strength was blocked to 15% of control, the soleus T4 response was depressed to only 75% of control. These results highlight major differences among competitive neuromuscular-blocking agents and suggest multiple sites of action. (Key words: Monitoring; stimulator, nerve. Muscle: gastrocnemius; soleus. Neuromuscular junction. Neuromuscular relaxants: pancuronium; d-tubocurarine; vecuronium.)

MEASUREMENT AND MONITORING of the degree of neuromuscular blockade have been achieved by the clinician using some combination of the single twitch, tetanic stimulus, and train-of-four (T4) stimulus to the adductor pollicis for determination of muscle strength. Several investigators have emphasized the utility of the T4 as a valid, quantitative measurement of evoked muscle response, which not only obviates the need for a control twitch response, but also provides greater sensitivity. In addition, it has been reported that the return of the T4 ratio correlates well with clinical voluntary tests of muscle strength (i.e., head lift, cough, inspiratory force, and peak expiratory flow rate) during recovery from neuromuscular blockade. Others state that the T4 ratio consistently decreases in close correlation with the single twitch depression during onset of neuromuscular blockade. It is important to note that d-tubocurarine has been used frequently in many of these studies. Whether other competitive neuromuscular-blocking agents produce comparable correlations is not entirely certain.

Equally noteworthy, the adductor pollicis, a predominantly fast muscle, has most commonly been utilized to monitor neuromuscular blockade for both investigative work as well as in clinical practice. On the basis of its evoked T4 and twitch responses and its dose-response characteristics, many of the above conclusions have been reported. The muscles responsible for ventilation and airway maintenance (i.e., diaphragm, intercostals, and vocal cord musculature) are all composed of varying combinations of fast and slow muscle. It is thought that the diaphragm is composed of a heterogeneous mixture of slow and fast fibers on the basis of histochemical and electromyographic analysis. It is unknown whether the information and conclusions obtained from fast muscle can be applied to either slow muscle or to muscles with a mixed composition.

Consequently, this investigation involved a comparison of fast and slow muscle response to a control T4 stimulus, as well as an evaluation of each muscle's characteristic dose-response to twitch and T4 ratio produced by each of three agents, d-tubocurarine (d Tc), pancuronium (PAN), and vecuronium (VEC). Use of an animal model for performance of experimental work enabled isolation of muscles that were predominately either fast or slow in composition.

Materials and Methods

Cats of either sex, weighing 2 to 3 kg were anesthetized with 75 mg/kg alpha chloralose, iv. Tracheosto-
mies were performed and the animals were ventilated mechanically with room air by a volume-regulated venti-
lator. Ventilator settings (i.e., tidal volume, $V_T$, and respiratory rate, $f$) were adjusted to maintain arterial 
blood $P_{O_2}$, $P_{CO_2}$, and $pH$ within normal limits for the 
cat, and were based on a nomogram of $V_T$ vs. body 
weight and $f$. An intravenous route was established in 
an external jugular vein, and an intraarterial cannula 
was attached to a blood pressure transducer. In addi-
tion, heart rate, ECG, and body temperature were moni-
tored.

Both the gastrocnemius (fast twitch) and soleus (slow twitch) muscles were isolated, and the sciatic nerve was 
cut after its dissection from the popliteal space. After 
the calcaneous was cut, the tendon of each muscle was 
attached to a separate force transducer using a steel rod 
in order to record the contractions of each muscle in-
dividually. The leg was mounted in a modified Brown 
Shuster myograph, and the exposed tissues were cov-
ered with a thermoregulated mineral oil pool. Drugs 
were administered intravenously. The cut sciatic nerve 
was stimulated by means of bipolar platinum electrodes 
with supramaximal rectangular pulses of 0.2-ms dura-
tion at a frequency of 0.2 Hz. A train-of-four stimulus 
(2 Hz X 2 s) was interposed prior to the injection of any 
drug to serve as a control, and also at the point of maxi-
mal twitch depression, approximately three minutes 
following the injection of any drug.

The muscle response was evaluated on the basis of 
control (pre-drug) twitch strength, and subsequently, 
dose-response relationships were expressed as either a 
per cent of control or per cent inhibition. A control 
(pre-drug) $T_4$ response (ratio of the fourth twitch height 
to that of the first) was determined for both fast and 
slow muscles. In order to assess the relationship between 
drug dose and $T_4$ response, each $T_4$ ratio (post-drug) 
was expressed as a per cent of the control $T_4$ ratio. In 
addition, the relationship between the twitch height and 
$T_4$ response was examined following the integration of 
dose-twitch response and dose-$T_4$ response data.

Best fitting lines for each dose-response curve were 
determined by the method of least squares. Comparison 
of the slopes of the fitted lines was made using a $t$ test.

**Results**

**Dose-Response Relationships for Gastrocnemius (Fast) and Soleus (Slow) Muscle**

The effective concentrations of $d$Tc, PAN, and VEC 
required to produce various degrees of twitch strength 
reduction were determined and compared for fast and 
slow muscles (fig. 1). The least potent agent was $d$Tc, 
and its $ED_{50}$ value (dose required for 50% depression of 
twitch strength) was 105 µg/kg, whereas PAN and 
VEC were considerably more potent with $ED_{50}$ values 
of 11.5 µg/kg and 18.5 µg/kg, respectively. For the 
soleus muscle, $d$Tc was again the least potent agent, 
with an $ED_{50}$ of 150 µg/kg, while PAN and VEC were 
neither equipotent with $ED_{50}$ values of 15 and 16 µg/ 
kg, respectively.

When comparing the twitch response of these mus-
cles, it is evident that $d$Tc exhibited a dose-dependent 
differential effect. For example, 120 µg/kg produced 
a mean twitch depression to $34 \pm 8$ (SEM) % of control 
in fast muscle, while slow muscle was blocked to only 
$68 \pm 14$% of control ($P < 0.05$). This difference in effect 
widened with higher doses; when 210 µg/kg were ad-
dministered, the mean fast muscle twitch was decreased 
to $3.5 \pm 3.5$% of control, while slow muscle twitch re-
mained at $33.5 \pm 6.5$% of control ($P < 0.05$). In addi-

† Published by Harvard Apparatus Company (Millis, Massachusetts).
pronounced amount of fade followed by a smaller degree of fade in the third twitch, which finally leveled off with little or no fading of the fourth twitch. When this frequency of stimulation was continued beyond the fourth twitch, neither fast nor slow muscle demonstrated any further change in twitch tension development, even after 20 such stimuli. It should be noted that the subsequent calculations of the soleus T₄ response following drug administration took into account this preexistent fade during the control period.

**T₄ Ratio of Fast and Slow Muscle Following Drug Administration**

The concentrations of each drug which produced various degrees of T₄ decrement also were determined for the gastrocnemius and soleus (fig. 2). Each of the drugs depressed the T₄ response in a dose-dependent fashion. In fast muscle, T₄ dose-response curves reflected a similar relationship in potency between the three drugs comparable to that observed for their respective twitch dose-response curves. In fact, the extrapolated ED₅₀ values for fast muscle T₄ depression (100 µg/kg for d Tc, 11 µg/kg for PAN, and 18 µg/kg for VEC) were nearly identical to the ED₅₀ values for fast muscle twitch depression obtained for each drug. VEC, however, was exceptional in that the T₄ response rarely was depressed beyond 40–50% of control at doses that nearly abolished the twitch.

In slow muscle, T₄ inhibition by d Tc and PAN also closely resembled their respective effects on slow twitch depression. The ED₅₀ values of PAN and d Tc for T₄ fade, 14 and 140 µg/kg, respectively, were very similar to their ED₅₀ values for slow muscle twitch depression. In contrast, VEC was fairly ineffective at producing a T₄ fade of the soleus, and even at the highest dose tested, the T₄ ratio remained above 75% of control, and an ED₅₀ value could not be calculated.

**Discussion**

In the clinical setting the evoked T₄ and the twitch response of the adductor pollicis, predominantly a fast muscle, has been used to provide information with regard to the general level of neuromuscular blockade. The results of this study indicate that these are valid measurements for PAN; a given dose of PAN would be expected to produce comparable responses across muscle types. With d Tc, however, the prediction of a slow or mixed muscle’s behavior, based on a fast muscle response might be subject to interpretation. This conclusion is based on the fact that slow muscle required a higher concentration of d Tc than did fast muscle to achieve the same level of neuromuscular blockade. In fact, it has been reported that the muscles of the hand are more sensitive to d Tc blockade than the muscles of...
respiration,\textsuperscript{12} sometimes referred to as "respiratory sparing".\textsuperscript{18,14} This has been documented in studies in humans that indicated a greater depression in head lift and hand grip as compared with inspiratory flow rates.\textsuperscript{13} Although the relative contribution of other factors (i.e., differences in temperature, blood flow, and motor innervation) could not be ruled out in these earlier studies, the in vivo preparation used in this investigation was designed to control for these variables. It is strongly suggested that this differential effect can be explained on the basis of the different sensitivities of fast and slow muscle fibers to this drug. It should be noted that this difference becomes increased in magnitude as the desired level of neuromuscular blockade is achieved.

In reference to VEC, difficulties also may arise from the transference of information obtained from the adductor pollicis to other muscle groups. This is especially pertinent to the T\textsubscript{4} measurement. In contrast, the twitch response seen in fast muscle closely corresponded to that seen in slow muscle. It appears as though twitch measurement is a more reliable indicator of blockade than the T\textsubscript{4} following VEC. Our results also indicate that VEC, unlike dTc, didn't produce a preferential effect on fast muscle. Based on this, VEC would not be expected to produce "respiratory sparing" as observed with dTc. This might be considered to reduce the margin of safety of the drug. However, its short duration and rapid recovery, coupled with its lack of cardiovascular effects, suggest that it is a safe drug with potential advantages.\textsuperscript{15}

It would be expected that a given degree of twitch depression would be associated with the same degree of T\textsubscript{4} inhibition among any series of competitive neuromuscular-blocking drugs if they possessed the same mechanism of action. Similar conclusions were reached by Williams et al.\textsuperscript{16} in their study of the effects of several nondepolarizing neuromuscular-blocking drugs in humans. They observed that the relationship between compound muscle action potential decrement vs. twitch depression was not uniform, and thus suggested that there was clear evidence for multiple sites of action among these drugs. Bowman concluded that tetanic fade, which is an exaggeration of T\textsubscript{4} depression, is independent of twitch depression.\textsuperscript{17} Thus, our results compliment previous reports which indicate that other agents appear to be mainly postsynaptic blocking agents. The finding that dTc produced significant T\textsubscript{4} fade correlates with other data that suggest a presynaptic site of action. Our results with VEC also confirm Bowman's conclusion that this agent does not bind to "fade sites" as rapidly as dTc or PAN as compared with its affinity for postjunctional receptors.\textsuperscript{17}

We must emphasize, however, that this resistance to fade was most evident in slow muscle following VEC. In addition, it must be stressed further that the two muscle types also responded in a different fashion to T\textsubscript{4} fade before any drug was administered. Therefore, the extrapolation of data across muscle types and between different species may present difficulty in interpretation with regard to mechanism of action or the assessment of muscle function after drug administration.

References